

RESEARCH ARTICLE OPEN ACCESS

Motivating Teachers in Rural Schools of Bhutan to Improve the Quality of Education

Yeshi. Sonam Chooden

Department of School Education, Ministry of Education. Tsirangtoe Central School

Yeshi83@gmail.com

Department of School Education, Ministry of Education. Tsirangtoe Central School

Sochen71@gmail.com

Abstract:

The purpose of the research paper is to study and to find out some rewards and to recognize teachers who are serving in some extremely remote areas of our country. Considering the fact that teachers play a major role in nation building, the study put forward two important rewards in the form of monetary incentive and non-monetary incentives for job satisfaction and continued commitment to the teaching profession. Further, to recognize the pivotal roles played by teachers in providing quality of education as most of the times get ignored during the important education conferences. The study was done based on comparison of the findings of other researchers and countries facing similar situations especially those under developed and developing countries as Bhutan is also in the transition period. There are many other forms of providing incentives in both the categories listed above but it was prioritize and discussed only those factors that would be easy to be instituted at the earliest considering all factors.

Keywords- Infrastructures, education, motivation, resources, quality.

Introduction

Schools are complex social organizations located in different places with students and staff from different social and economic background, cast-creed, and individual differences. Fact that education has being recognized as an important factor for the human capital development and for poverty reduction, lots of new schools are established and many upgraded to the next higher level every year. It is recognized both as a basic right and as a pre-requisite for achieving the wider social, cultural, and economic goals.ⁱ Education contributes to social and democratic development and may also lay the ground for sustainable economic development generallyⁱⁱ. Different

country has their own education system and years of schooling. It is notable that schools located in the urban areas perform better than the schools located in rural areas. It could also be because of the education level of the parents in the remote places. Parents of rural children, for instance, tend to have lower levels of education, and many places a lower valuation on the returns to education than their urban counterparts.ⁱⁱⁱ About 70% of the schools in Bhutan are located in rural and very few in semi-urban and urban areas, due to the slow economic growth and improper infrastructures and facilities development. Annual education report 2010 reflects that 4130 teachers are serving in community Primary schools, Primary schools and lower secondary schools out of 6609 teachers

employed in the country. Teachers are reluctant to go to those difficult places due to the proximity to the health care facilities, improper structure of the school buildings, with very less or no incentives provided, and other related hardships, leading to an uneven distribution of teachers. According to Annual Education Report 2011, 32% of the schools are not connected with electricity and 54% of the school still doesn't have access to the road facility. The distribution of teachers is uneven, with surpluses in urban areas coexisting with shortages in rural schools. These rural schools are often deprived of the facilities in comparison to the urban schools in terms of materials, infrastructure, environment, proper health facilities, inadequate monitoring from the Ministry, and importantly inadequate teachers in the schools. Typically, the pattern is that there are fewer teachers in the least attractive locations, such as rural areas or the poorest urban areas. Some of the teachers found in these areas tend to be untrained, recruited to cover the teacher shortage or under-qualified because most of the qualified choose to stay in urban schools. In the local news paper, Ministry of education exclaimed that, "In the tiger year, the education ministry is committed to ensure that teacher supply meet demand by 2013,"^{iv} Ground work has already been done by recruiting lots of graduates in the two existing training college and also introducing 'community teachers' in the year 2010. But the question still lies if quality education can be achieved with increased number of teachers because those who join the teaching profession are not with genuine interest except few and the 'community teachers' are just high school graduates without proper training programs.

The difficulty of teacher deployment is also a major cause of inefficiency in the provision of education system and run counter to the aim of equitable educational provision. Qualified teachers are often reluctant to go to rural settings and find some ways and get posted in urban schools after

the completion of their training or year later after staying in the semi-urban just to fulfill the norm of the ministry. Because getting posted in a rural school could sometimes be a one way ticket as getting transfer is quite challenging even if we have stayed in those schools for the mandated period as per civil service rule, 2012.

Purpose of the study

Teachers play an important role in grooming the children and preparing them for the global market apart from day to day teaching-learning processes. On the other hand teaching is deemed to be a noble profession, a demanding and complex profession in comparison to other profession. It is generally accepted that the competence and commitment of teachers are two of the most important determinants of learning outcome.^v To sustain the energy and enthusiasm for the work, teachers need to maintain their personal commitment to the job.^{vi} With the increasing number of population and increased enrollment of students, from about 400 students in the early 60's, total enrolment has exponentially increased in all levels of formal education and tertiary institutes in Bhutan to 182,462 as of March 2011, reflecting a growth of about 11% since the start of the 10th Five Year Plan in 2008,^{vii} exerting pressure to the Ministry of Education to provide proper education, facilities, and preparing children to meet the demands of the public, private and the international organization requiring, skills, knowledge and capabilities. Teachers and the quality of teachers are crucially important to any education system to provide quality education to equip students and meet the education standard. Although there would be many other determinants affecting the learning outcome of the students, teaching is deemed to be one of the main factor in the school level for the student's outcome. Thus, ways to increase teacher motivation and capabilities are central to any systematic attempt to improve learning

outcome.^{viii} In the opening remark of training of trainers on Transformative Pedagogy, 2nd July, 2016, Honorable Minister, Ministry of education, exclaimed that “If there ever be a silver bullet to improve the quality education, it would be teacher development.” Much concern is placed on teacher development and is vested on the motivation and love for the profession. The output from the education system rests upon the teachers, - and “What happens in the classroom” is important^{ix}. The urgency need of self-motivated teachers is felt in the country because it is a critical factor in determining the quality of education through quality teaching even if the administration fails. There appears to be mounting concerns that unacceptably high proportions of teachers working in public school systems in many low income developing countries (LIDCs) are poorly motivated due to a combination of low morale and job satisfaction, poor incentives, and inadequate controls and other behavioral sanction.^x Bhutan is with no exception due to the fact that it is developing country and the revenue generated is distributed among all the 10 ministries with certain portion to the Ministry of Education. Further, the major portion of the budget is consumed to provide free universal education, education for all till grade 10. With this fact, education reforms could hardly take place and is also evident that some of the facts and figures in almost all the text are obsolete. This also probe a challenge to the teachers serving in rural schools when they are not access to the internet to provide correct figures and facts, could be one demotivating factor.

Teacher shortage in rural school has been a major concern, a challenge, and an issue in Bhutan. It has been observed that teachers are reluctant to serve the remote schools even if it is directed by some educational and civil service rule (Section 14.2.6). The civil servant is expected to serve at least three years in the rural areas^{xi}. Due to the non-compliance of the set policy, it has resulted in

uneven distribution of teachers in the country affecting the teacher pupil ratio in the all the schools. Generally, the indicator of teacher shortage and quality of education is determined by the teacher pupil ratio. The indicator though the national average student- teacher ratio is low, it is accompanied by high standard deviation of 10.3 indicating a high and uneven distribution of teachers among the schools and Dzongkhags (district) with some having very high STR and some very low STR^{xii}. Teacher ratio and class size are two important indicators of the quality of education because if the classes are crowded more than its capacity, quality teaching will not be possible, again, if the teachers have to teach many subjects, quality will go down.^{xiii} To combat the uneven distribution of teachers, Ministry has implemented a plan to limit on the number of years a teacher can serve in urban school to five. Still there is an acute shortage of teachers in general, but the rural schools faces the most difficulties in comparison to those schools located in urban, with better facilities. Remote areas offer fewer amenities or opportunities for cultural activities and social engagement that are typically desired by professionals.^{xiv} The situation for teachers is deteriorating all over the world today; the status of teachers is decreasing at the same time as the working conditions are getting worse^{xv}. Consequently, graduates opt teaching profession as their last resort meaning that they are not genuinely interested in teaching but were left with no other alternatives, which later become a factor declining quality of education. In the same line most of the high school teachers in public and private are expatriate teachers because the qualified ones do not join the service or quit the profession after few years. At present around 11% of the total teaching force is expatriate.^{xvi} Further after their graduation, teachers resist being placed in the rural schools because of the long walking distance, proximity to the health facilities, language barriers, martial

cases and low living standard in the rural communities. Social, cultural, and professional isolation may be reasons for losing rural teachers.^{xvii} In addition to that, there is the diversity challenge in rural education that includes social and cultural diversity^{xviii} and the motivation factors in rural schools are comparatively minimal. Due to which many of the teacher leaves the profession in an alarming rate. The table below shows the number of teachers who left the profession between 2008 and 2015.

Table 1: Number of teachers who left the system by level and year.

Level	Higher Secondary	Middle Secondary	Lower Secondary	Primary School	Extended Classroom
2008	41	34	16	8	3
2009	62	32	29	30	1
2010	54	43	54	126	4
2011	61	46	42	118	5
2012	66	97	42	57	2
2013	54	31	56	118	2
2014	47	34	47	48	3
2015	49	73	49	52	0
Total	434	390	335	557	20

Source: Annual Education Statistics 2015, PPD, MoE, Royal Government of Bhutan

A survey conducted on motivation level of teachers in the well-developed countries like Argentina and Mexico, 2014 found that teachers had low level of motivation even in a rich country like theirs. Most teachers didn't want to go to class to teach but their attention and interest rather deviated either to become a manager or they wanted to work in other educational work like educational planning and developing curriculum.

According to Tuner (1992), motivation involves arousal, direction and persistence, as people engage in complex instinctive behavior^{xix}. This questions the school, community, Principals, management, and the Ministry, how they would raise the motivation of the teachers so that they provide quality teaching for better learning outcomes of students. Decline in the quality of education has been one of the top issues when discussions are held during the education conference in Bhutan. Lots of discussions are also held in the daily newspaper but what could be the factor that is leading to the deterioration of the quality of education? Who is responsible for it, what can government do, what is the role of the community, what sort of policy should we frame, how can school foster learning and how can teachers play a major role to improve the quality of education? To solve all the issues pointed above, teachers can play a major role in improving the quality of education as they mingle everytime with their students. But the question lies, if all the teachers are willing to take this responsibility with full dedication and enthusiasm. So, this could be achieved only if there are sets of highly motivated teachers in all the schools and teachers who exhibits selflessness, dedication and love the profession. The decline in the quality of education in public school in most of the LIDCs has made some of the parents to send their children to private schools because of the facilities and also teacher

faculty. Most of the good teachers leave the public schools and join the private schools because of a good pay package and in some of the private schools teachers pay increases dramatically if their students do extremely well in the board exams, pay for performance. But in the public school the increment is annually in a fixed ceiling. So even if they work hard the remuneration that they get is the same.

Traditionally, the strong intrinsic motivation of teachers has been closely associated with the high status of teachers in society.^{xx} It is seen that the status of teachers has dramatically declined during the recent times when lots of problems occurred in the school especially when some of the teachers didn't follow the teacher's code of conduct prescribed by the Ministry of Education. Teacher motivations are very low resulting in poor performance of students in rural schools, often students choosing to drop out of the school because learning is not enjoyable as teacher fail to make it so. Annual education report 2010 indicates that dropout rate in primary school is about 2.02% and repeaters about 6.4%, 0.73% and 3.9% in lower secondary, and 0.00% and 0.5% respectively in middle secondary which are mostly located in urban settings^{xxi}. The data clearly indicates that children in rural schools are not performing well, though it may depend upon other reasons; availability of resources, class size, infrastructure, environment etc... but importantly it would rest upon how the teachers' resort to find solutions for these constrains and communicate effectively making the teaching learning process more enjoyable. Further, the impact of incentives for the recruitment and retention of qualified teachers in Namibias's remote schools carried out by UNICEF rebuilds that, In Sub-Saharan African (SSA) and south Asian countries, challenges to adequate quality education are particularly acute in rural region.^{xxii}

On this note, I have looked at teacher motivation in mainly in to two broad categories monetary incentives and non-monetary incentives. Further, the deliberation and discussion made under different forms of incentives under each categories.

Objectives of the study

This research aims to study the motivating factors to boost the morale of our teachers and motivate teachers working in the remote schools and ways to attract teachers in the remote schools. It aims to provide:

Measures to retain teachers in the remote schools of Bhutan

Study and explore different measures that the government could take to motivate teachers of rural schools.

Explore factors that contributes to enhances professionals and professionalism

Suggest some recommendation to retain, attract, and motivate teachers of rural schools.

Methodology

This research is based and backed up by the study made by the different authors who conducted research on similar ground around the world. This research would also entail the current scenario of the Bhutanese Education system, the governing policies and other factorial evidences and changes, that has taken place and the observations made after being in the system for more than a decade. It highlights on the alarming rate of teachers who left the system looking for better opportunities as evident from the reading, teachers morale and motivation are very low, encouraging many teachers leaving the noble profession, especially from the remote schools.

“About 4% of the teachers in government schools leave the profession every year for various reasons. Between 2014 and 2015, 198 teachers, or roughly

3% of the total teachers in the government schools, left the teaching profession.^{xxiii}

In this research paper I have tried to compare the educational policies and differentiate different variable adopted by other countries in compared to the Bhutanese Education trends. Factors and determinants, which affect the teacher moral and motivation are also, compared in depth to propose for new findings for the reformation of new educational policies for quality education in Bhutan. Teacher morale impacts directly on delivery of lessons, teachers' effectiveness and leadership, student attitudes, behavior and discipline, as well as student performance.^{xxiv}

Hence, I have dealt with prominent strategies that the government would be able to focus on intrinsic motivation of teachers to let them love the profession and make difference in the education system and also in the lives of children.

Literature Review

1. Monetary Incentives

Government should provide rural teachers with walking distance, some kind of monetary remunerations in the form of salary increment, bonuses, teaching allowances or hardship allowances to motivate them. More over they also don't get chances to go on tour unlike other officials benefiting with traveling allowances and daily subsistence allowances. The importance of adequate remuneration to ensure an honest civil servant perform better and motivate, is widely recognized during the international discourse on civil service and pay reform. Though it would escalate the performance of the employee, but the government would face difficulties to work out on pay package and other remuneration without proper field study. Further the adoption of new policy may also discourage the teachers residing in urban schools due to inability to go to remote schools though they are willing, but

constraint due to health, marital and family reasons, if proper policy measures are not taken in to considerations.

Again the case may be ignited when teachers complain that they are not paid as number of working hours they are involved in doing official works. The recent issue of Bhutanese online news rebuilds that 77 percent of slots in education still remain vacant^{xxv} because graduates are not willing to take teaching as their profession. Teacher salary for a fresh B.Ed graduate is only about \$270 with yearly increment of less than \$7. A research conducted by Ssali "Rewards and job commitment of Primary school teachers" in Mityana District, indicated that teachers did not receive a good salary 153 (98.7%) compared to 2 (1.3%) who agreed that they received from his sample^{xxvi} creating low morale and low performance. On the other hand, teacher has to work nearly 12-14 hours a day including lesson planning and student assessment apart from teaching in the classroom, which takes most of their leisure time. Further, most of the educational reform programs are all geared towards changing fundamental teaching and framing new policies and plans. These not only adds work load to the teachers and gives insufficient attention to the factors affecting the teacher morale especially the working atmosphere and incentives. Being a teacher, lots of sacrifices has to be made often leading to commotions at home, since you are not able to give time to your family. As a result most of the teachers are planning to quit the job or look for greener grass, after the completion of the 10th year, as compulsion imposed by the Ministry of Education, to retain the teachers to cover up the teacher shortage.

Government should properly examine the current situation with proper scrutiny before the situation gets out of control. Paying teachers for what they deserve and compensating their sacrifices would

motivate them and also help school perform better improving the quality of education.

Table 2: Evaluation

Strength	<p>Qualified teachers will also go to remote schools</p> <p>Quality of education will increase because teachers will be highly motivated and satisfied.</p> <p>Teacher shortage can be eradicated because most of the teachers would have reasons to opt for remote schools.</p> <p>TPR will improve</p> <p>Improve working atmosphere as teachers would have fewer periods to teach the children</p>
Weaknesses	<p>Budget constrained of Government may be a problem.</p> <p>Chances of excessive teachers in the rural schools</p> <p>Higher spending on teachers may not always guarantee quality.</p>

2. Provision of Non-financial Incentives

The working atmosphere where majority of the teachers are working are very challenging and daunting, especially in the rural and semi urban areas. Lack of access to modern technology, facilities like proper classrooms with lighting facilities, staffrooms, and insufficient teaching learning materials are clearly demotivating. However, the limited impact of many of these interventions has forced politicians and policymakers to focus increasingly on the needs of teachers themselves.^{xxvii} Provision of non-financial incentives of providing better training opportunities, better housing, special study leave, fast track promotion, and privilege during the interviews would also motivate teachers. And working conditions, professional development opportunities, and instructional leadership by

principals and central office administrators are also highly desired by teachers (Farka, Jonson, & foleno, 2000).^{xxviii} Some schools still face shortage of classrooms and had to introduce shift system to cover up the classroom shortage^{xxix} indicating that there is no proper working atmosphere because it would give a burden to the teachers and hamper the management of the schools. Statistics 2008, Policy and planning Division indicates that 60% of the schools reported to have sufficient water supply were 40% of the schools still don't have proper drinking water facilities indicating poor sanitation in the schools. But, major incentives for teachers residing in rural schools would be the provision of housing for teachers, where they can be around the school, if otherwise they would spend lots of time travelling, hampering the school making things beyond schedule. Mulkeen, 2007 as quoted in the impact study on incentives for the recruitment and retention of qualified teachers in Naminia's states Poor infrastructure and housing, inadequate school resources and poor public provision often also make rural postings undesirable to qualified teachers. Situation in Bhutan is that most of the local community lives under poverty and due to the poverty prevailing in the villages; people cannot build houses to be rented to the teachers and other staff. As a result most of the teachers have to stay in the temporary shed built by the community with the locally available materials and limited budget approved by the government due to financial problem or because of the less future enrollment projected done for the next five years. Where government foresees fewer enrollments after a few years, they provide minimal capital budget; school buildings are renovated and used, less supply of furniture and office equipment. This policy of government in a positive way is it control budgetary loss, but on the other hand it is demotivating strategy constraining teachers to go to these schools because they perceive that the government is overlooking and compromising the situation

with future anticipation. The situation is still prevalent in the schools located in the remote pocket of the country. Now, due to the institution of “Central schools”, most of the schools nearby the central schools are not allotted enough capital budgeted as most of the cluster school’s children having a walking distance about an hour will be given boarding facilities in the central schools.

Further, housing is particularly important for female teachers for security and social reasons in the remote schools. Such cultural norms are typically enforced more strongly in rural areas, making female teachers reluctant to accept rural posting.^{xxx} Owing to it, in some remote settings female teachers safety is also a big concern as most of the remote schools of Bhutan are located away from the town are where by they have to walk for number of days ranging from one day. Again as an evidence of the gender disparities, the annual education statistics 2008s shows that, in remote areas and Community Primary School, the number of male teachers is much higher than that of female teachers but the proportion of female teachers in the public Higher Secondary Schools is around 30%^{xxxi} which are all located in urban or semi urban areas. The proportion of girls choosing to become teachers is hovering around 40%^{xxxii} for the past five years. In Malawi, official education data reveals a strong association between the availability of housing in an area and the presence of female teachers in the school.^{xxxiii} As stated in impact study done by UNICEF on teacher incentive, Malawi shows that 82% of urban teachers were all female in 2005 while women constituted only 31% of rural teaching faculty. Again in Uganda, a recent study on teacher attrition considers the provision of housing to be a key factor in ensuring teacher retention, especially in rural areas^{xxxiv} indicated a positive relation, better housing were populous and vice-versa. With many schools without proper housing, one of the key factor for motivating and ensuring teacher

retention in rural schools, government should do a proper study of the locality to find out if teachers can rent house around, if not government should build houses to motivate teachers and for teacher retention so that it ultimately leads to quality education through quality teaching.

Other reason could be availability of resources. Most of the school receives their education materials late only after the academic session starts, making teachers job difficult. Though the policy reflects that all the educational materials should be delivered by the supplier to the schools before the start of the academic session, but in the reality is that there is no proper monitoring of this policy by the Ministry. Lots of time is wasted in the beginning of the year waiting for the supplies and the ultimate loser being the students because teacher has to rush and complete the syllabus before time due to the time loss in the beginning.

Table 3: School with road connectivity by Dzongkhag(district), 2015

Ownership	Dzongkhag(District)	Motor road accessibility		
		Yes	No	% Yes
Public	Bumthang	18	1	95%
	Chhukha	26	16	62%
	Phuntsholing thromdey	4	0	100%
	Dagana	23	5	82%
	Gasa	2	4	33%
	Haa	7	5	58%
	Lhuentse	22	3	88%
	Mongar	39	17	70%
	Paro	20	0	100%
	Paro	25	9	74%
	Punakha	22	4	100%
	Samtse	23	28	74%
	Sarpang	16	7	85%
	Samdrup jongkhar	21	8	72%
Sjonkhar	3	0	100%	

thromdey			
Thimphu	8	3	73%
Thimphu thromdey	18	1	95%
Trashigang	49	12	80%
Trashiyangtse	24	5	83%
Trongsa	14	9	61%
Tsirang	13	5	72%
Wangdi	25	8	76%
Zhemgang	15	13	54%

(Source: Annual education statistics 2015, MOE, Policy and Planning Division)

Further, high student teacher ratio (STR) and more number of teaching period in the remote schools due to the insufficient teachers has really discouraged teachers going to remote schools. Again, Large class size and heavy workloads in relation to pay (the effort price of work) also make teachers resistant to the introduction of new teaching methodologies and other innovation.^{xxxv} As a result they do what is mandated but fail to exhibit their talents and creativity to foster a conducive learning environment for a quality output. The lower is the STR, higher is the availability of teacher for the students. Student teacher ratio also has an implication on quality delivery of lessons and quality education.

“The STR has implications not only on the cost of education, but also on the quality. The relationship between these two measures teacher workload is affected by a variety of factors, including the number of classes for which a teacher is responsible and the number of classes taken by students.”^{xxxvi}

Table 4: Student teacher ratio in schools by location in 2015

Primary School	23	22	18	19	20
Lower Secondary	21	25	20	20	22
Middle Secondary	19	25	20	21	19
Higher secondary	20	19	20	23	
Level	Urban	Semi Urban	Semi Remote	Remote	Very remote

(Source: Annual Education Statistics, 2015, MOE, Policy and Planning Division)

With the increasing number of graduate passing from the two training institute, the problem is now getting solved every year and is definite that it would still take some more time. The similar challenge is faced by Malawi, Teacher teaching lower classes are faced with large and manageable classes. Class size of more than 100 pupils per class is common in Malawi particularly in the first three grades. Understandably teachers in such school often seek a transfer to ‘better’ schools.^{xxxvii} Government should also consider the fact that to some, monetary benefit is not just the end to teacher motivation, but for some none monetary incentive would weigh more than it. So, it is necessary for the policy and planning sector of the ministry to plan the set up the school with all the

facilities to encourage more teachers opting for rural schools.

Table 5: Evaluation

Strength	Motivated teacher will impart quality education Qualified teachers will be an asset for the rural schools Mixed group of male and female teachers in the schools. Conducive environment for teaching and learning will be created.
Weaknesses	Budget constrain would be a problem It would be a budgetary loss for the government to build huge structures Corruption may breed during the selection training and promotions Long term planning need for implementation

2.1 Career Development for Rural Teachers

Though the ministry’s policy states that every teacher will get 80 hours of professional development program’s comprising of National Based In-service Training, District Based In-service Training, and school Based In-service Training, it is notable that 60-70hrs trainings are mostly School based in-service training conducted by the colleagues in their respective schools. In some cases the facilitator doesn’t have much knowledge and skills related to the field but do it as a norm to abide by the policy. With those who has attended National Based Inservice training program, they conduct School Based Inservice Training but most of the information get lost during the information dissemination. Another, factor that relates to the issue mentioned of miscommunication and information asymmetry is the low qualification of the teachers. Around 84% of our teachers have at least a Class X certificate,

16% of the teachers are Dzongkha Language Teachers (national language teachers) and less than 1% of the teachers do not have a class X certificate.^{xxxviii} It reflects the competency level of our teachers and if it is not polished now and then, though teachers derive monetary benefits during the training programs, the quality teaching is not going to take place in the classroom.

Teachers teaching the students using their old skills learnt during their training period, the quality of teaching may be low because they did not get chance to upgrade themselves. Further, teachers in rural schools often have very less access to better facilities and support services in comparison to their counterparts teaching in urban schools, which creates a massive knowledge and skill gap in using new methodology acquired through modern technology and information sharing among school, since they are located near to each other.

In almost all the remote schools, teacher faces difficulties in accessing to books and relevant materials that can boost their professionalism. Teachers need to be abreast of continuous professional development (CPD) as well as support from the peers and supervisor for a quality output. And in the absence of clear and appropriate intervention, teachers can lose motivation and if persisted they resort to quitting job looking for other opportunities. Further, without the electricity they don’t have Internet and communication facility with which they would have communicated their problems. According to Annual Education Report 2011, 32% of the schools are not connected with electricity and 54% of the school still doesn’t have access to the road facility.

Table 6: Electricity connectivity per level, 2015

Level		Electricity connections		
		Yes	NO	% Yes
Public school	Primary school	276	42	87%
	Lower secondary school	73	5	94%
	Middle secondary School	67	1	99%
	Higher Secondary School	40	0	100%
	ECRs	45	51	47%
	Total	501	99	84%

(Source: Annual Education Statistics, 2015, MOE, Policy and planning division)

Table 7: School with internet connectivity per level, 2015

Level		Electricity connections		
		Yes	NO	% Yes
Public school	Primary school	137	181	43%
	Lower secondary school	47	31	60%
	Middle secondary School	39	29	57%
	Higher Secondary School	38	2	95%
	ECRs	3	93	3%
	Total	264	336	44%

(Source: Annual Education Statistics, 2015, MOE, Policy and Planning division)

Addition to that parents being less educated, in general, there are less chance of monitoring the student achievement and the teaching, whereby no complains would be made against the teachers, meaning that there is no proper check and balance. Hardly, Ministry

personnel visits these schools, so they have a very vague idea of what is happening in the schools and what sort of professional support should be given to the teachers. Further, rural teachers are frustrated when their urban counterpart gets ample opportunities to attend career development programs more than how much they get. They feel that they are ignored and their being in rural school is insignificant.

With the discovery of new teaching methods and skills, it is important to give rural teachers ample opportunities for their career development to enhance motivation and professionalism to impart quality education through quality teaching.

Table 8: Evaluating third option Theoretical Claim

Strength	<p>Teachers can update the skills and knowledge and impart to the students</p> <p>Professionalism will be enhanced.</p> <p>Better understanding of the subject matter and enhance cooperative learning with peers from other schools.</p> <p>Will help in management and work towards achieving organizational goal of imparting quality education</p> <p>Motivate teachers to join rural school</p>
Weaknesses	<p>It may be a short term measure since the opportunities are rare.</p> <p>Ministry may not be able to determine the exact professional support services without proper field survey.</p> <p>Financial implication would be a major challenge to implement this plan because training should be provided in an equitable manner or may lead to biasness.</p>

Theoretical Claim

The issue being addressed here is how rural teachers can be motivated to escalate their performance to provide quality education. According to Maslow's hierarchy of Need theory, it suggests that human needs are in hierarchical order with basic physiological needs at the base and self-actualization on the top. When one need is fulfilled they crave for the other needs, as human needs are unlimited. Considering the needs and human desire, proposed suggestive recommendation will try to satisfy rural teachers need, make them committed and improve their performances to some extent since providing of total satisfaction to all the teachers may not be possible because some may value monetary incentive more than nonmonetary and for some training opportunities would be the top priorities.

Empirical evidences

Kasaija (1996)^{xxxix} in a study about "effects of monetary and non monetary rewards on motivation among teachers in post primary institutions in Hoima and Masindi Districts" empirically it was shown that in 1970s teachers' remunerations remained very low in terms of monetary which resulted in many teachers leaving the teaching service due to low income.

In Isarel, 62 secondary schools were selected randomly across the country to see the 'effectiveness of teachers' performance incentives' in the forms of performance awards on pupils' achievements. It clearly suggests a clear and positive relation between the exposure of teachers to performance incentives and post-program students' achievement in the second year of the program^{xl}. The mean number of credit unit and the average score had increased indicating that monetary incentives motivates teacher and make them work harder for more incentive, which ultimately benefited the students.

Finding and Discussions

Considering the various issues discussed above and policy options suggested, and also looking at the experiences and evidences from other countries it would be better to take the under listed policy recommendation to motivate teachers for rural placement, and in the long run it will encourage graduates to take the profession as their career.

Monetary Incentives

In the development of any education system, teacher and teaching are very important to achieve quality output, which can be achieved from motivated and satisfied teachers. Better qualified teachers will not only help to improve quality of education but also help in proper management of the school with the demonstration of skills and knowledge. But the tragic story is that none of the teachers are interested in going for the remote school, where their skills and knowledge are desperately needed. The low proportion of qualified and experienced teachers working in rural schools is one of the most serious problems preventing the attainment of Education for all (EFA) with reasonable learning outcomes in most LIDCs.^{xli} Maintaining teacher's morale in the rural areas is one of the major challenges because they feel isolated with very less support and collegiality. A survey conducted in March 2008 by policy and planning division, it was reported that 23 schools had only 1 teacher^{xlii} all located in the remote parts of the country because most of the teachers go on transfer after serving for three years and the new teachers resist from going.

In general, teachers are paid according to a single-salary schedule that provides salary increments according to a teacher's years of experience and number of college or university units and degrees^{xliii}. Further the teacher moral and motivation in public schools are very low

compared to teacher in private schools because of the ban on giving tuition to the students by teachers of public schools. On the other hand teachers of Private schools enjoy the autonomy of giving tuition to the students, which is indeed a lucrative business, earning more than their salary. According to a research conducted by B. Paul and A. Kwame (2007) on Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia, they claim that it is widely contended that the status of teachers in most OECD countries has declined appreciably during the last fifty years, teacher autonomy and creativity has been curtailed by more control and regulation and that teachers are being asked to do more with less.^{xliv} Apart from the salary, other main sources to improve teacher morale providing monetary incentive would be giving bonuses and allowances. According to the UNICEF’s finding on teacher’s motivation, monetary incentives are often seen as the primary instrument for incentivizing teachers to teach in rural areas.^{xlv} Though the teachers in the current situation are given teaching allowances, but it implies to both the teacher residing in rural and urban school calculated as per the number of years serving in the teaching services as shown below. Actually it was the government’s initiative to attract more graduates to choose teaching their career due to the teacher shortage but not exactly as a motivational measure for the teachers. Simply attracting qualified teachers to rural areas or retaining them there appears to be especially difficult for most countries.^{xlvi} It is sometimes quite bias because those energetic new teachers are given less allowance compared to those senior teachers. But the fact is that, most of the teacher tries to shift their profession after the compulsion tenure of 10years after availing the training. So, in order to stop the out flow of teacher more allowance is given to the senior teacher for retention.

Table 9: Shows Lump-sum professional allowance for teachers

Position	Revised lump sum			
	No. of years	(0 -5)	(6 – 10)	Above 10
EX/ES1	5,460	8,815	10,915	
EX/ES 2	4,580	6,870	9,155	
EX/ES 3	3,870	5,805	7,740	
P 1	3,100	4,650	6,200	
P 2	2,735	4,105	5,475	
P 3	2,400	3,600	4,800	
P 4	2,135	3,205	4,275	
P 5	1,750	2,625	3,500	
S 1	1,635	2,455	3,275	
S 2	1,485	2,225	2,965	
S 3	1,355	2,035	2,710	
S 4	1,205	1,805	2,405	
S 5	1,115	1,670	2,225	

(Source: Ministry of Finance, Bhutan. www.mof.gov.bt)

Above policy may help the education Ministry to attract more university graduate to join the teaching profession but would not motivate and satisfy the existing teachers in the remote schools because they are not made distinct from the urban teachers, either will not motivate highly qualified teachers to go to remote areas because they will get the same benefit even if they stay in an urban areas. Some kind of comparative advantage should be there between the two groups to draw the attention of the qualified urban teachers to opt for rural schools. Following allowance scheme would definitely encourage most teachers for rural schools, since it would justify their hardships with some monetary incentives as shown below.

1. Proposed Pay package is to compensate the hardships and motivate teachers of rural schools.

The proposed policy option is not only to increase teacher's monetary benefits but also to motivate and compensate the sacrifices that rural teachers are making. If teachers are paid below market, salaries need to be increased or the quality, and thus the effectiveness, of individuals entering and remaining in teaching is likely to fall (Rosen & Flyer, 1994).^{xlvii} Being in the remote part of the country, many of the teacher lose track of their profession, the fact being located at walking distance from the road point. Though it has less to do with the quality of education^{xlviii}, it will facilitate the supply of materials and goods on time and also facilitates the movement of teachers and students. Most of these schools are also not connected with electricity and health care facilities because they are located far away. Only about 50% of the CPSs have electricity^{xlix} meaning that there are no computer and telephone facilities to communicate with the changes taking place around. For such type of schools the professional development opportunities are also rare and the commodities price is also very high as it needs to be transported on horses. Further another disparity is that the location of schools is not homogeneous, so in order to compensate all these sacrifices and working in a difficult place and also to motivate them looking at the difficulty level, it would be wise on the part of the government to pay incentives in the form of a "Hardship allowance." Though hardship allowances are paid to teachers in many countries but it doesn't seem to have major impact on teacher as it applies to only a certain part of the teachers in the remote schools. Lesotho, a high altitude and landlocked kingdom in South Africa like Bhutan also tried to provide their teachers "Hardship Allowance" which was equal to 10% of their monthly income. Further,

Mozambique also tried to offer a bonus of 100% of their monthly salary to relocate the teachers and to motivate them to teach in the rural areas. Since it was targeted to the qualified teachers for rural schools, the government failed to achieve the target as they failed to classify the remoteness of the place. The low-lying remote areas were not given the incentives even if they are at par in terms of having the daily amenities with the high lying remote areas in the former case. And in the later case of Mozambique provided bonus for the teachers who taught students in double shift making the income same with the one who is serving in the rural area. Here too the urban teacher had additional task with the remuneration of 60% on their basic pay. The situation is almost the same in Bhutan, Ministry of finance has worked out on the hardship allowance but failed to motivate all staff working in the remote schools because hardship allowance fail to differentiate people working in the remote and urban areas.

Further, Ministry of Finance of Bhutan has passed a financial norm stating that, if a place is connected with a farm road whether it is motorable or not, the hardship allowance would not be provided. This has really discouraged the teachers of remotes school as most of the time these road gets blocked due to the heavy rainfall in almost all the parts of the country for the small cars that are affordable by teachers with their depleted salary. According to our government the "Hardship" is equated only with the connectivity of the road, and other factors unimportant. Nearness to the health facilities, availability of electricity, availability of everyday used materials, excess to information, getting transferred to the home town, social and cultural ties, being near to their home town, family and kinship are also some very important factors that has to be considered. Often teacher who went on transfer claim that they are going on transfer because of the lack of excess to the information where they loose opportunities for training and

scholarships. Opportunities for further training too are often less for rural based teachers.ⁱ If equal or more opportunities is provided to the remote school, definitely some portion of the teacher work force would be willing to serve without other benefits. Some have suggested that special allowances be made for highly qualified teachers willing to work in rural areas for a fixed period and that these monetary incentives further be complemented with career development opportunities such as in-service training.ⁱⁱ Multi benefit of providing some monetary benefit and lots of training opportunities for the teacher would be great tools to attract teachers in the remote areas and to retain the ones who are already there. Hence, I would Propose Ministry of Education in collaboration with the Ministry to work on the incentive package for teacher, considering some important factors. A sample of draft pay package and incentives that that would bring some reformation in the teacher deployment is shown below.

Table 10: Proposed incentive scheme to motivate teachers to the rural schools (monthly)

Teacher	Basic Pay (start from \$300)	With no Electricity (lump sum)	Teaching Allowance	Walking Distance from the Nearest road head		
				1 day	2 days	3 days
1	Will depend upon the graduate	\$ 30 for all without electricity	Will depend upon the Number of years in service	\$ 20		
2				\$20	\$20	
3				\$20	\$20	\$20

Note: Every increase in official walking distance, \$ 20 would be given additionally as shown above.

Recommendations

The purpose of the suggestive recommendation is to establish a proper monetary benefit system to motivate rural teachers and compensate the sacrifices being in a disadvantage place and to motivate and improve the quality of education through highly dedicated professionals.

The additional monetary benefit will lead teachers to work more on the job. If a proper monetary incentives are rewarded to the employees and if their basic necessities are accessible, their commitments for the output will be raised, improving the performance in terms of better test scores.

Providing separate financial incentives for rural teachers would increase the contentment level of rural teachers because they are compensated of what they are not able to enjoy like their mates in urban schools. It will also differentiate them from others residing in the better place.

Conclusion

If the Proposed recommendation is put in place, we can expect lots of teachers in rural schools because the monetary incentive will attract lots of teachers. Teacher with high qualifications usually resist from going to rural schools but with the new monetary incentive package, we are also expected to see them in rural schools. Then quality teaching learning would take place making teaching more enjoyable, resulting to less student repetition and less dropout rate.

The incentive package would highly motivate teachers and in the long run we will be able to phase out the problem of teacher shortage in general and teachers in rural schools because most of the graduate will be willing to take teaching as their career. Further, we will also be able to solve the problem of expatriate teacher because statistics 2008 rebuilds that at the higher secondary level, 32 percent of the teachers are expatriates, 17 percent

in middle secondary level, and 28 percent in private school, with the majority being employed in the private higher secondary levels.^{lii} Further, good education system in place in the rural community, would be a key instrument to elevate poverty and help achieve national objective of economic growth and development. With the increase in literacy rate, community will also take part in the developmental activities benefiting the nation as a whole.

Abbreviation

STR- Student Teacher Ratio
PPD- Policy and planning Division
ECR- Extended Classroom
PS-Primary School
LSS-Lower Secondary School
MSS- Middle secondary School
HSS- Higher Secondary School
MOE- Ministry of Education
RGOB- Royal Government of Bhutan
SSA- Sub-Saharan African
UNICEF- United Nation International children
Emergency Fund
EX- Executive
ES- Specialist
P- Professional
S-Supervisory
MOF- Ministry of Finance
RCSC-Royal Civil Service Commission
LIDCs-Low income developing countries
EFA-Education For All

Acknowledgement

I would like to acknowledge Mr. Changyong Choi, Professor, KDI School of Public Policy, and Management, who has been my class advisor and Professor for most of the management studies that I took during my Masters degree in KDI School of Public Policy and Management, Republic of South

Korea. He has been very supportive during the time when I struggled with the courses that I took during my study as some of the courses involved Economics and Mathematics. His generous support as a class advisor has not only help me complete my studies but also made my stay in Korea a very enriching and fruitful. He has always been a source of inspiration for me and also for all the students who took his courses.

Further, I would like to thank him for all the support and inspiration that he gave me to take up this research, which I believe would definitely help our government to look into the hardship that rural teachers are facing not only in our country but also all around the globe.

References

-
- [1].ⁱ Zam, D. (2008). *The Development of Education: National Report of Bhutan. Policy and Planning*
- [2]. Division, Ministry of Education, Thimphu, Bhutan. (p.6)
- [3].ⁱⁱ Kubbtrud, V., Helland, A. M. & Smith, R. L (1999). *Teachers in south; Their development and*
- [4]. *congitions of service* . Report 1999-5 (p.4)
- [5].ⁱⁱⁱ The impact of incentives for the recruitment and retention of qualified teachers in Namibia's remote schools(10th
- [6]. September, 2014, Unicef, United for children. Unicef.org (p.10)
- [7].^{iv} Kuensel, Bhutan's Daily News Paper - Feb. 6, 2011, Thimphu, Bhutan
- [8].^v B.Paul, A.Kwame(2007). *Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and*

-
- South Asia, Department for international Development, Researching the issue 2007.
- [9].^{vi} Day, C. (2000). *Stories of Change and Professional development: The costs of commitment*. In C. Day & A. Fernandez & T. Hauge & J. Moller (Eds.), *The life and work of teachers: International perspectives in changing times* (pp. 109-129). London: Falmer Press.
- [10].^{vii} *Annual Education Statistics*(2011). Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [11]. www.education.gov.bt.
- [12].^{viii} B.Paul, A.Kwame(2007). *Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia*, Department for international Development, Researching the issue 2007.
- [13].^{ix} Coombe, T. (1988) "*Integral Planning for the Staffing Function in Education*": Paper presented at the
- [14]. workshop on *The Future of Strategic Education Planning*, Paris: IIEP.(p 1-2)
- [15].^x B.Paul, A.Kwame(2007). *Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia*, Department for international Development, Researching the issue 2007.
- [16].^{xi} *Draft Bhutan Civil Service rules and Regulations* (2012). Royal Civil Service Commission.
- [17]. Royal Government of Bhutan (p. 267)
- [18].^{xii} *Annual Education Statistics*(2011). Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [19]. www.education.gov.bt. (p.65)
- [20].^{xiii} *General statistics 2008*. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education. www.education.gov.bt.(p.36)
- [21].^{xiv} *The impact of incentives for the recruitment and retention of qualified teachers in Namibia's remote schools*(10th September,2014), Unicef, United for children. Unicef.org (p.10)
- [22].
- [23].^{xv} Kubbrtud, V.,Helland, A. M. & Smith, R. L (1999). *Teachers in south; Their development and*
- [24]. *congitions of service* . Report 1999-5
- [25].^{xvi} *General statistics 2008*. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education. www.education.gov.bt.(p.28)
- [26].^{xvii} Collins, T. (1999). *Attracting and retaining teachers in rural areas*. ERIC Clearinghouse on
- [27]. *Rural Education and Small Schools*. Charleston WV. Retrieved 2 August, 2007, from
- [28]. <http://www.ericdigests.org/2000-4/rural.htm>
-

-
- [29].^{xviii} Nelson, C. G. (2004). *The diversity challenge in rural education. English Journal*, 93(6), 22.
- [30].^{xix} Turner, C. (1992) *Motivating staff: Mendip paper 033*. Blagdon: Staff College.
- [31]. Varlaam, A., Nuttall, D., & Walker, A. (1992). *What makes teachers tick? A survey of teacher morale and motivation*. London: Centre for Educational Research, London
- [32]. School of Economics and Political Science.
- [33].^{xx} B.Paul, A.Kwame(2007). *Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia*, Department for international Development, Researching the issue 2007.
- [34].^{xxi} *Annual Education Statistics*(2010). Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [35]. www.education.gov.bt.
- [36].^{xxii} The impact of incentives for the recruitment and retention of qualified teachers in Namibia's remote schools(10th September,20140, Unicef, United for children. Unicef.org (p.10)
- [37].^{xxiii} *Annual education statistics* (2015). Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [38]. www.education.gov.bt.
- [39].^{xxiv} P, Mangendri (2011). Key strategies to raise teacher morale and improve school climate. Distinguished Fulbright awards in teaching Program.
- [40].^{xxv} Kuensel, Bhutan's Daily News Paper – Dec. 01, 2012, Thimphu, Bhutan
- [41].^{xxvi} Ssali, G. (2011). *Rewards and job commitment of primary school teachers in Mityana district*. Unpublished master's dissertation, Makerere University, Kampala, Uganda.
- [42].^{xxvii} B.Paul, A.Kwame(2007). *Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia*, Department for international Development, Researching the issue 2007.
- [43].^{xxviii} Farkas,s., Johnson, J., & Foleno, T.(2000). *A sense of calling: who teaches and why*. New York: Public Agenda.
- [44].^{xxix} *General statistics 2008*. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [45]. www.education.gov.bt(p.40)
- [46].^{xxx} The impact of incentives for the recruitment and retention of qualified teachers in Namibia's remote schools(10th September,20140, Unicef, United for children. Unicef.org (p.10)
- [47].^{xxxi} *General statistics 2008*. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [48]. www.education.gov.bt(p.28)
-

-
- [54].^{xxxii} General stastics 2008. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [55]. www.education.gov.bt.(p.29)
- [56].^{xxxiii} Adedeji, S and Olaniyan, O (2011). *Fundamental for Teacher education Development:Improving the conditions of teachers and teaching in rural schools across African countries.* UNESCO:
- [57]. International Institute for capacity building in Africa.
- [58]. Adedeji, S and Olaniyan, O (2011). *Fundamental for Teacher education Development:Improving the conditions of teachers and teaching in rural schools across African countries.* UNESCO: International Institute for capacity building in Africa.
- [59]. B.Paul, A.Kwame(2007). Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia, Department for international Development, Researching the issue 2007.
- [60].^{xxxv} Annual education statistics (2015). Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [61]. www.education.gov.bt.
- [62].^{xxxvi} Esme, K Chip(2006). Teacher motivation and incentives in Malawi, Research fellow,centre for Educational Research and training, university of Malawi.
- [63].^{xxxvii} General stastics 2008. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [64]. www.education.gov.bt.(p.31)
- [65].^{xxxviii} Kasaija, A. I. (1991). *Effects of monetary and non-monetary rewards on motivation among teachers in post primary institutions in Hoima and Masindi Districts.* Unpublished master's dissertation, Makerere University, Kampala, Uganda.
- [66].^{xxxix} Lay, V. (1992). *Evaluating the Effect of Teachers' Performance Incentives on Pupils' Achievements.* Department of Economics, Hebrew University Mt. Scopus, Jerusalem 91905, Israel
- [67].^{xl} B.Paul, A.Kwame(2007). Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia, Department for international Development, Researching the issue 2007.
- [68].^{xli} General stastics 2008. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.
- [69]. www.education.gov.bt.(p.34)
- [70].^{xlii} Odden,A & Kelley,C (2002). Pau teachers for what they know and do: New and smarter compensation strategies to omprove schools. Crowin Press, INC. A saga publications company Thousand Oaks, California.
- [71].^{xliii} B.Paul, A.Kwame(2007). Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa

and South Asia, Department for international Development, Researching the issue 2007.

[80].^{xlv} The impact of incentives for the recruitment and retention of qualified teachers in Namibia's remote

[81]. schools(10th September,20140, Unicef, United for children. Unicef.org (p.10)

[82].^{xlvi} Bennell, P. (2004). Teacher motivation and incentives in Sub-Saharan Africa and Asia. Department for International Development. Brighton.

[83].^{xlvii} . Rosen,s., & Flyer, F (1994). The new economics of teachers and education. Chicago: University of Chicago

[84]. Department.

[85].^{xlviii} General stastics 2008. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education. www.education.gov.bt.(p.44)

[86].^{xlix} General stastics 2008. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education. www.education.gov.bt.(p.43)

[87].^l The impact of incentives for the recruitment and retention of qualified teachers in Namibia's remote

[88]. schools(10th September,20140, Unicef, United for children. Unicef.org (p.10)

[89].^{li}Urwick, J., Mapuru, P., & Nkhoboti, M. (2005). Teacher motivation and incentives in Lesotho. London: Department for International Development.

[90].^{lii} General stastics 2008. Policy and planning Division, Ministry of Education.

[91]. www.education.gov.bt.(p.29)